



BSI Standards Publication

Petroleum products — Equivalency of test method determining the same property

Part 100: Background and principle of
the comparison and the evaluation of
equivalency

National foreword

This Published Document is the UK implementation of ISO/TR 19686-100:2016.

The UK participation in its preparation was entrusted to Technical Committee PTI/2, Liquid Fuels.

A list of organizations represented on this committee can be obtained on request to its secretary.

This publication does not purport to include all the necessary provisions of a contract. Users are responsible for its correct application.

© The British Standards Institution 2016.

Published by BSI Standards Limited 2016

ISBN 978 0 580 92995 3

ICS 75.080

Compliance with a British Standard cannot confer immunity from legal obligations.

This Published Document was published under the authority of the Standards Policy and Strategy Committee on 31 December 2016.

Amendments/corrigenda issued since publication

Date	Text affected
-------------	----------------------

**TECHNICAL
REPORT**

**ISO/TR
19686-100**

First edition
2016-12-01

**Petroleum products — Equivalency
of test method determining the same
property —**

**Part 100:
Background and principle of the
comparison and the evaluation of
equivalency**

*Produits pétroliers — Équivalence des méthodes d'essai déterminant
la même propriété —*

*Partie 100: Fondement et principe de la comparaison et de
l'évaluation de l'équivalence*



Reference number
ISO/TR 19686-100:2016(E)

© ISO 2016



COPYRIGHT PROTECTED DOCUMENT

© ISO 2016, Published in Switzerland

All rights reserved. Unless otherwise specified, no part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized otherwise in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, or posting on the internet or an intranet, without prior written permission. Permission can be requested from either ISO at the address below or ISO's member body in the country of the requester.

ISO copyright office
Ch. de Blandonnet 8 • CP 401
CH-1214 Vernier, Geneva, Switzerland
Tel. +41 22 749 01 11
Fax +41 22 749 09 47
copyright@iso.org
www.iso.org

Contents

Page

Foreword	iv
Introduction	v
1 Scope	1
2 Normative references	1
3 Terms and definitions	1
4 Comparison	1
4.1 Reasons for divergence.....	1
4.2 Equivalency.....	1
5 Questionnaire for checking similarities of test methods	2

Foreword

ISO (the International Organization for Standardization) is a worldwide federation of national standards bodies (ISO member bodies). The work of preparing International Standards is normally carried out through ISO technical committees. Each member body interested in a subject for which a technical committee has been established has the right to be represented on that committee. International organizations, governmental and non-governmental, in liaison with ISO, also take part in the work. ISO collaborates closely with the International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) on all matters of electrotechnical standardization.

The procedures used to develop this document and those intended for its further maintenance are described in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1. In particular the different approval criteria needed for the different types of ISO documents should be noted. This document was drafted in accordance with the editorial rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 (see www.iso.org/directives).

Attention is drawn to the possibility that some of the elements of this document may be the subject of patent rights. ISO shall not be held responsible for identifying any or all such patent rights. Details of any patent rights identified during the development of the document will be in the Introduction and/or on the ISO list of patent declarations received (see www.iso.org/patents).

Any trade name used in this document is information given for the convenience of users and does not constitute an endorsement.

For an explanation on the meaning of ISO specific terms and expressions related to conformity assessment, as well as information about ISO's adherence to the World Trade Organization (WTO) principles in the Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT) see the following URL: www.iso.org/iso/foreword.html.

The committee responsible for this document is ISO/TC 28, *Petroleum products and related products of synthetic or biological origin*.

A list of the parts of ISO/TR 19686 can be found on the ISO website.

Introduction

In 2010 ISO/TC 28 established a working group to investigate the development of test method equivalency tables. This proposal resulted from the discussion about identities, equivalences or differences in test methods related to fuels. It was concluded that a more structured approach would be useful.

The task of determining equivalency appeared to be a difficult and complex one; it was therefore decided that each property would be taken into account in turn and addressed in separate Technical Reports. In 2014 ISO/TC 28 agreed that a base document would be developed to show how the experts effectively compared the test method standards and evaluated their equivalency. This document gives that guidance.

Petroleum products — Equivalency of test method determining the same property —

Part 100:

Background and principle of the comparison and the evaluation of equivalency

1 Scope

This document describes the procedure for evaluation in order to determine the equivalency of test methods used on a global scale in quality specifications of petroleum products, lubricants, liquid fuels and gaseous fuels for transportation purposes. The result of the assessment on each property is presented in a separate part of ISO/TR 19686. This document is intended to guide laboratories that use one part of ISO/TR 19686 and wish to know if they can also use other parts.

2 Normative references

There are no normative references in this document.

3 Terms and definitions

No terms and definitions are listed in this document.

ISO and IEC maintain terminological databases for use in standardization at the following addresses:

- IEC Electropedia: available at <http://www.electropedia.org/>
- ISO Online browsing platform: available at <http://www.iso.org/obp>

4 Comparison

4.1 Reasons for divergence

When compared test methods are originally based on the same document(s), then at the time of first publication these methods may be designated “identical”. However, if the derived methods are used in different regional, legislative and/or technical environments, they will diverge over time due to independent revision; therefore the designation “identical” will slowly move towards “equivalent” or even to “different”.

4.2 Equivalency

The designations “identical”, “equivalent” or “different” can be factored into a set of important analytical parameters which do affect applicability, results and precision as follows:

- a) test method scope;
 - 1) applicability to specific product groups,
 - 2) measurement ranges;
- b) interferences (matrix effects/disturbances);

- c) test equipment/apparatus;
- d) procedural items (internal/external standard, calibration, sample preparation, etc.);
- e) precision, ILS (Interlaboratory Study) information.

Any comparison of test methods should give comprehensive answers to the above mentioned issues. Several approaches to these “identity questions” sometimes reduce the above findings to categories such as:

- **Identical:** same technical scope, procedures, results, and precision, only editorial differences due to different editorial styles;
- **Equivalent:** some differences introduced in technical aspects such as updated precision, extension of scope or range, etc.;
- **Different:** introduction of significant technical changes such as different equipment, different calibration or calculation has changed the test result or the way the test result may be or is used.

5 Questionnaire for checking similarities of test methods

The questionnaire presented in Table 1 should serve as a starting point for a more structured approach for a test method comparison. When more than one precision statement is available it is prudent to also assess the significance of any difference for $r = f(x)$ and $R = f(x)$ after collection of the details from the round robin data of the test methods.

The following main issues should be compared:

- A. measured property;
- B. instrumentation used;
- C. calibration;
- D. sampling and sample handling;
- E. test method procedure as such;
- F. precision information and the data on which it has been determined;
- G. any other relevant information.

After the requested details have been compiled, a consensus opinion on the extent to which the compared test methods are identical/equivalent/different and which steps would be necessary to increase test similarities has been developed.

Each part of ISO/TR 19686 gives a conclusion of the assessment, i.e. whether the methods under review can be considered identical or not.

Table 1 — Test method comparison matrix

		Method A	Method B	Comparison (Identical/equivalent/different)
A	Issues concerning measured properties			
A.1	Which properties are determined (also which units)?			
A.2	What exactly is the principle of measurement?			

Table 1 (continued)

		Method A	Method B	Comparison (Identical/equivalent/different)
A.3	Which products can the test method be applied to?			
A.4	What is the measurement range (per property)?			
A.5	Which components can interfere with the determination?			
A.6	Are there any matrix effects to consider?			
B	Issues concerning instrumentation			
B.1	List all required equipment including specific manufacturers if any are mentioned			
C	Issues concerning calibration			
C.1	What procedure is used to prepare calibration standards? If calibration standards are purchased, what requirements are placed on those standards?			
C.2	Are the standards Internal or external to the measurement of the tested property in the test sample?			
C.3	What is the calibration procedure? Which calculations are done to complete the calibration?			
D	Sample handling and preparation			
D.1	Sample handling details?			
D.2	Sample preparation procedure?			
E	Procedural test method details			
E.1	What are the test method procedures?			
E.2	Which measurement is made?			
E.3	Requirements for reporting/rounding of results?			

Table 1 (continued)

		Method A	Method B	Comparison (Identical/equivalent/different)
E.4	What QC sample is used to verify that the system is in statistical control?			
F	Precision information			
F.1	What are the precision statements (r, R)?			
F.2	Dispersion of r(x), R(x) (95 % confidence bands)?			
F.3	How old are the precision statements?			
F.4	What document records the inter laboratory study that supports the precision statement?			
F.5	How many/which sample types have been included in RRT?			
G	Any additional and helpful information			
G.1	Technical references used to develop the test method?			
G.2	Do other related test methods exist?			

British Standards Institution (BSI)

BSI is the national body responsible for preparing British Standards and other standards-related publications, information and services.

BSI is incorporated by Royal Charter. British Standards and other standardization products are published by BSI Standards Limited.

About us

We bring together business, industry, government, consumers, innovators and others to shape their combined experience and expertise into standards-based solutions.

The knowledge embodied in our standards has been carefully assembled in a dependable format and refined through our open consultation process. Organizations of all sizes and across all sectors choose standards to help them achieve their goals.

Information on standards

We can provide you with the knowledge that your organization needs to succeed. Find out more about British Standards by visiting our website at bsigroup.com/standards or contacting our Customer Services team or Knowledge Centre.

Buying standards

You can buy and download PDF versions of BSI publications, including British and adopted European and international standards, through our website at bsigroup.com/shop, where hard copies can also be purchased.

If you need international and foreign standards from other Standards Development Organizations, hard copies can be ordered from our Customer Services team.

Copyright in BSI publications

All the content in BSI publications, including British Standards, is the property of and copyrighted by BSI or some person or entity that owns copyright in the information used (such as the international standardization bodies) and has formally licensed such information to BSI for commercial publication and use.

Save for the provisions below, you may not transfer, share or disseminate any portion of the standard to any other person. You may not adapt, distribute, commercially exploit, or publicly display the standard or any portion thereof in any manner whatsoever without BSI's prior written consent.

Storing and using standards

Standards purchased in soft copy format:

- A British Standard purchased in soft copy format is licensed to a sole named user for personal or internal company use only.
- The standard may be stored on more than 1 device provided that it is accessible by the sole named user only and that only 1 copy is accessed at any one time.
- A single paper copy may be printed for personal or internal company use only.

Standards purchased in hard copy format:

- A British Standard purchased in hard copy format is for personal or internal company use only.
- It may not be further reproduced – in any format – to create an additional copy. This includes scanning of the document.

If you need more than 1 copy of the document, or if you wish to share the document on an internal network, you can save money by choosing a subscription product (see 'Subscriptions').

Reproducing extracts

For permission to reproduce content from BSI publications contact the BSI Copyright & Licensing team.

Subscriptions

Our range of subscription services are designed to make using standards easier for you. For further information on our subscription products go to bsigroup.com/subscriptions.

With **British Standards Online (BSOL)** you'll have instant access to over 55,000 British and adopted European and international standards from your desktop. It's available 24/7 and is refreshed daily so you'll always be up to date.

You can keep in touch with standards developments and receive substantial discounts on the purchase price of standards, both in single copy and subscription format, by becoming a **BSI Subscribing Member**.

PLUS is an updating service exclusive to BSI Subscribing Members. You will automatically receive the latest hard copy of your standards when they're revised or replaced.

To find out more about becoming a BSI Subscribing Member and the benefits of membership, please visit bsigroup.com/shop.

With a **Multi-User Network Licence (MUNL)** you are able to host standards publications on your intranet. Licences can cover as few or as many users as you wish. With updates supplied as soon as they're available, you can be sure your documentation is current. For further information, email subscriptions@bsigroup.com.

Revisions

Our British Standards and other publications are updated by amendment or revision.

We continually improve the quality of our products and services to benefit your business. If you find an inaccuracy or ambiguity within a British Standard or other BSI publication please inform the Knowledge Centre.

Useful Contacts

Customer Services

Tel: +44 345 086 9001

Email (orders): orders@bsigroup.com

Email (enquiries): cservices@bsigroup.com

Subscriptions

Tel: +44 345 086 9001

Email: subscriptions@bsigroup.com

Knowledge Centre

Tel: +44 20 8996 7004

Email: knowledgecentre@bsigroup.com

Copyright & Licensing

Tel: +44 20 8996 7070

Email: copyright@bsigroup.com

BSI Group Headquarters

389 Chiswick High Road London W4 4AL UK